

Indiana Philosophical Association
Spring Meeting 12
April 2008 at Butler
University
Room 326 Atherton
Union

Program

- 9:30** Coffee
- 10:00** *A Naturalistic Immortality*
Charlie Hobbs, Southern Illinois University-Carbondale
Commentator: Tom Howald, Franklin College
- 11:00** *"The Potentiality Problem" Redux*
Christopher Pynes, University of Western Illinois Commentator: Jason Eberl,
Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis
- 12:00** Lunch
- 1:30** Business Meeting
- 2:15** *Three (Mistaken) Accounts of Evidential Support* Chris
Tucker, Purdue University Commentator: Jared Bates,
Hanover College

Abstracts

“A Naturalistic Immortality”

Charlie Hobbs, Southern Illinois University-Carbondale

I consider a naturalistic approach to death, seeking to articulate a naturalistic or "functional" version of immortality. Making use of John Dewey and other classical American philosophers, I first articulate the naturalism of this project. I then discuss what such naturalism means for understanding the self and its survival. Finally, I consider the existential question about to what extent such a view of immortality is satisfying.

i

“The Potentiality Problem” Redux

Christopher Pynes, University of Western Illinois

Elizabeth Harman has argued in "The Potentiality Problem" (*Philosophical Studies* 114: 173-198, 2003) that there is a problem with the use of potentiality as an explanation of why harms to babies matter more, morally than similar harms to cats when potentiality grants more moral status. She claims potentiality is not sufficient to grant more moral status to babies over cats, because early embryos have that same potentiality, but early embryos lack moral status. I shall argue that she has three problems and provide solutions for her analysis:

(1) Hannan's definitions are not consistent, what I call the Logical Problem; (ii) her analyses of moral status are incomplete for use in her arguments, what I call the Moral Status Problem; and (iii) the potentiality problem can be solved without her special effectiveness of potentiality to increase harms for babies and cats, but not embryos, or the Conceptual Problem.

“Three (Mistaken) Accounts of Evidential Support”

ChrisTucker, Purdue University

In this paper, I will criticize three contingent accounts of evidential support, that is, three accounts that claim it is contingent whether or not some proposition supports another proposition- The failure of these accounts will suggest (but hardly prove) that it is necessary whether or not some proposition supports another proposition. The issue of whether evidential support is necessary has implications for most externalist accounts of inferential justification. These externalists typically say that reliability, proper function or some other contingent relation is required for inferential justification, and they assume that evidential support is to be understood in terms of that relation. Thus, they assume that it is contingent whether or not some proposition supports another proposition. Yet, if that assumption is false, externalists face an uncomfortable dilemma.

Directions from the north on 1-65 (Chicago)

Take 1-865 east to 1-465 east; take 1-465 east to Exit 31 -Meridian Street; turn right on Meridian Street; travel to 46th Street; turn right on 46th Street - 46th Street leads directly to a one-way traffic roundabout at the main campus entrance; bear to the right of the flagpole; visitor parking spaces are available on the left side of this street

Directions from the north on 1-69 (Detroit)

Take 1-465 west to Exit 31-Meridian Street; turn left on Meridian Street; travel to 46th Street; turn right on 46th Street; 46th Street leads directly to a one-way traffic roundabout at the main campus entrance; bear to the right of the flagpole; visitor parking spaces are available on the left side of this street

Directions from the south on 1-65 (Louisville)

Take Exit 113-Meridian Street (north); turn right on Meridian Street; travel to 46th Street; turn left on 46th Street; 46th Street leads directly to a one-way traffic roundabout at the main campus entrance; bear to the right of the flagpole; visitor parking spaces are available on the left side of this street

Directions from the southeast on 1-74 (Cincinnati)

Take 1-465 west to **1-65** north; take Exit 113-Meridian Street (north); turn right on Meridian Street; travel to 46th Street; turn left on 46th Street; 46th Street leads directly to a one-way traffic roundabout at the main campus entrance; bear to the right of the flagpole; visitor parking spaces are available on the left side of this street

Directions from the east on 1-70 (Columbus, Ohio)

Take 1-65 north to Exit 113-Meridian Street (north); turn right on Meridian Street; travel to 46th Street; turn left on 46th Street; 46th Street leads directly to a one-way traffic roundabout at the main campus entrance; bear to the right of the flagpole; visitor parking spaces are available on the left side of this street

Directions from the West on 1-70 (St. Louis)

Take 1-465 north to exit 17-38th Street; turn right on 38th street; travel to Clarendon Road (You will pass a shopping mall and the Indianapolis Museum of Art); turn left on Clarendon road (Clarendon is immediately past Crown Hill Cemetery); travel to Hampton Drive; turn right; at the next stop sign, turn left onto Sunset Avenue; travel to the stop sign at 46th Street; turn left into the one-way traffic roundabout at the main campus entrance; visitor parking spaces are available on the left side of this street

Parking on Campus:

Designated visitor parking is available throughout campus. If you are unable to find a visitor parking space, a temporary parking permit is available from the Butler University Police Department (525 W. Hampton Drive) or the Office of Admission (Robertson Hall).

From: PeterJ.Murphytmurphyp@uindy.edu]
 To: Howald, Tom
 Cc:
 Subject: Re: Comment at IPA?

Sent: Fri 3/21/2008 10:54 PM

Howald Attachments can contain viruses that may harm your computer. Attachments may not display correctly.

Attachment*: Q A Naturalistic Immortality.

IPA.doc(71KB) Hi Tom,

Thanks for agreeing to comment on the paper - it is attached. The author is Charlie Hobbs from Southern Illinois University; his email address is chobbs@slu.edu. Please try to have your comments to him by Saturday April 5.

I will send David another email this weekend. Presently, I am secretary/treasurer, Jonathan is vice-president, and Eric is president. On April 12, Jonathan will become president, I will become vice-president, and someone else will take over as secretary/treasurer.

Best,
 Peter

— Original Message —

From: "Tom Howald" <thowald@franklincollege.edu>

To: "Peter J. Murphy" <murphyp@uindy.edu>

Sent: Thursday, March 20, 2008 6:02:36 PM GMT -08:00 Tijuana / Baja California

Subject: RE: Comment at IPA?

Peter,

Yes, I'd be happy to comment I have a couple of favors to ask. I tried to use the announcement of the upcoming meeting to enter the current officers into the IPA webpage, but they were not exactly specified. If you could send me that information, I'd appreciate it. Also, I still do not have from David McCarty the paper he delivered in the fall. Thanks, and I'll look forward to getting the paper. All the best,
 Tom

From: Peter J. Murphy

[mailto:murphyp@uindy.edu] Sent: Thu

3/20/2008 3:03 PM To: Howald, Tom Subject:

Comment at IPA?

Hi Tom,

I'm writing to see if you can comment on a paper at the upcoming meeting of the Indiana Philosophical Association on Saturday April 12 at Butler University. The paper we have in mind is "A Naturalistic Immortality". The paper develops a pragmatist-style account of immortality. Please let me know if this is something you can do.

Best wishes,
 Peter Murphy
 IPA Secretary/Treasurer